City of York Council	Committee Minutes
MEETING	SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE
DATE	26 MARCH 2007
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS KIRK (CHAIR), MERRETT (VICE- CHAIR), BLANCHARD, CUTHBERTSON, HILL, HYMAN AND LIVESLEY

APOLOGIES COUNCILLORS

61. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chair reported that no declarations had been made at the meeting.

62. MINUTES

The minutes of the last meeting held on 26 February 2007 were agreed as a correct record subject to the addition of "and also as an honorary member of CCT" in relation to Councillor Merretts declaration of interest under Minute No. 56."

63. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Chair reported that no registrations to speak had been received under the Council's Public Participation Scheme.

64. HIGHWAYS MAINTENANCE PROCUREMENT AD HOC SCRUTINY SUB-COMMITTEE

(A) Members considered the draft final report of the Highways Maintenance Procurement Ad-Hoc Scrutiny Sub-Committee in relation to Part A of its remit.

SMC was required to endorse the report for submission to the Executive and accordingly considered recommendations in relation to following objectives of the review:

- The potential efficiencies from a PFI arrangement;
- Alternative options should PFI Expression of Interest be unsuccessful:
- Cost effectiveness of those alternative options;
- Expenditure profile over lifespan of PFI; and
- PFI cost implications

The Chair of the scrutiny review was present to answer any queries and accepted a number of revisions/clarifications suggested by Councillor Merrett, also an original member of the reviewing Sub-Committee.

RESOLVED:

That the report be endorsed for submission to the Executive, as agreed to be amended by the Chair of the Scrutiny Sub-Committee, and Members and Officers be thanked for their time in producing a clear and easily read final report.

(B) Part B Remit

Members then considered a proposed remit for Part B of the highways maintenance procurement topic with a view to Part B of the agreed review progressing early in the next Municipal Year.

A full discussion was held in relation to the proposed remit and the first two objectives set out in Annex A were agreed. In regard to the final objective Members agreed to amend it as follows:

 To compare the actual cost to the Council since 2003 in respect of Highways procurement to the costs originally included in the Best Value Review of 2001 and examine the managerial processes put in place to implement the savings and agreed actions

RESOLVED: That the amended remit be endorsed and the review be commenced early in the next Municipal Year.

65. FINAL REPORT OF EDUCATION SCRUTINY COMMITTEE - HOME TO SCHOOL TRANSPORT SERVICES

Members considered the draft final report of the Education Scrutiny Committee in relation to the home to school transport services review. Members were informed that Education Scrutiny Committee had investigated the contracts for home to school transport and considered whether it would be possible to introduce higher quality buses and improve safety.

It was understood that the final draft would be considered by Education Scrutiny Committee on 28 March 2007. SMC was considering it earlier on this occasion to enable the report to be submitted to the Executive on 24 April 2007.

Members discussed the overarching principles and made the following comments:

- Future consideration might need to be given to applying the recommendations to secondary schools depending upon the proposals contained in forthcoming legislation; and
- The reference in recommendation 2, paragraph (c) to CRB checks should be amended to read "within the last 3 years".

RESOLVED: That the draft final report be endorsed for submission to the Executive, subject to the above comments and any revisions made by the Education Scrutiny

Committee at its meeting on 28 March 2007.

66. TANG HALL AREA ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN AD-HOC SCRUTINY SUB-COMMITTEE - INTERIM REPORT

Members considered an interim report on progress being made with the review being undertaken by the Tang Hall Area Asset Management Plan Scrutiny Sub-Committee.

Members noted the progress made so far against the objectives but some Members expressed concern about some aspects of the review in relation to the original remit, which it was agreed would be better discussed at the next meeting of the Scrutiny Ad-hoc Sub-Committee.

RESOLVED: That the interim report and progress so far be noted.

67. UPDATE ON IMPROVING ELECTRONIC MANAGEMENT PROCESSES FOR SCRUTINY

Members considered a progress report on developing the new electronic management processes for scrutiny, including a forward plan, available as part of the new Committee Management System.

RESOLVED: That the planned introduction of an electronic scrutiny

forward plan be noted, together with other developments for producing reports and tracking of

decisions.

Cllr Kirk, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.00 pm and finished at 6.25 pm].